



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

**HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2024**

The City of San Antonio Historic and Design Review Commission (**HDRC**) met on Wednesday, December 4, 2024, at 1901 South Alamo Street, San Antonio, Texas 78204.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER:

Chair Gibbs called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Savino, Velásquez, Galloway, Mazuca, Guevara (virtual), Grube, Fetzer, and Gibbs.

ABSENT: Castillo, Cervantes and Holland.

- Commissioner Holland joined virtually at 3:09 p.m.
- Commissioner Castillo joined virtually at 3:44 p.m.

CHAIR'S STATEMENT:

Chair Gibbs provided a statement regarding meeting processes, appeals, time limits, decorum.

ANNOUNCEMENT:

- Spanish interpreter services available to the public during the hearing.
- Reminder that City of San Antonio offices will be closed for the winter holidays from December 24, 2024, through January 1, 2025.
- OHP staff announced that Historic Specialist Claudia Espinosa's last day with the Office of Historic Preservation is December 6, 2024.
- Item 4 was pulled from the consent agenda for applicant presentation.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

MOTION: Vice Chair Fetzer moved to approve HDRC meeting minutes for November 20, 2024.
Commissioner Velásquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Velásquez, Galloway, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Castillo, Cervantes and Holland.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 8 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

- Item 1 – The King William Association Architectural Advisory Committee submitted a letter in support of staff findings and recommendation for approval.
- Item 3 – Valerie Cortez on behalf of the Dignowty Hill Neighborhood Association Architectural Review Committee submitted a voicemail in support of staff recommendations.

- Item 3 – The Dignowty Hill Neighborhood Association Architectural Review Committee submitted a letter with the same information outlined in the voicemail.
- Item 6 – Hoda Cummings submitted a voicemail in support of the case.
- Item 6 – Lisa Lynde, on behalf of the King William Association Architectural Advisory Committee submitted a voicemail in opposition to the case.
- Item 6 – The King William Association Architectural Advisory Committee submitted a letter with the same information outlined in the voicemail.
- Item 6 – Maria Gude submitted a voicemail in support of the case.
- Item 6 – Marla M submitted a voicemail in support of the case.

Chair Gibbs asked if any commissioner would like to pull items from the Consent Agenda.

- Commissioner Savino requested Item 2 be pulled for individual consideration.

CONSENT AGENDA:

Item 1, Case No. 2024-390 1210 S ALAMO ST
 Item 3, Case No. 2024-392 1510 E HOUSTON ST
 Item 5, Case No. 2024-394 540 ADAMS ST
 Item 6, Case No. 2024-382 622 CEDAR ST
 Item 7, Case No. 2024-387 335 E PARK AVE

MOTION: Commissioner Velásquez moved to approve items 1, 3, and 5-7 with staff stipulations.
 Commissioner AMG seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Velásquez, Galloway, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
 NAY: None.
 ABSENT: Castillo and Cervantes.

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEMS:

ITEM 2. HDRC NO. 2024-381
 ADDRESS: 9302 ESPADA RD
 APPLICANT: Fernando De Leon/One Stop Code Consulting

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 1-story, single-family residential structure on the vacant lot at 9302 Espada Road, located within the Mission Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through o with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant confirm a foundation height that is consistent with the Guidelines, as noted in finding f. A foundation height of between six (6) inches and one (1) foot should be used.
- ii. That stucco feature a traditional trowel finish and that stone be installed in a traditional manner, as noted in findings i and l.

- iii. That windows adhere to the adopted standards for windows in new construction, and that all grouped windows be separated by a mullion of six (6) inches in width.
- iv. That all mechanical equipment be screened from view from the right of way, as noted in finding m.
- v. That the proposed driveway be limited to no more than ten (10) feet in width, as noted in finding o.
- vi. That a detailed landscaping plan be submitted for review and approval as noted in finding n.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Vice Chair Fetzer moved to approve with staff stipulations and the added stipulation to wrap the stone veneer on the bedroom wing 3ft around the north and south walls.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Galloway, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: Savino and Velásquez.
ABSENT: Castillo and Cervantes.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES. 2 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

ITEM 4. HDRC NO. 2024-376
ADDRESS: 2419 MCCULLOUGH AVE
APPLICANT: Scott Carpenter/Seventh Generation Design, Inc.

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval of the following scopes of work at 2419 McCullough:

1. Demolish the existing, rear accessory structure that originally served as servant's quarters.
2. Construct a new, rear accessory structure to the immediate south of the primary historic structure on site.
3. Reconstruct the historic structure's front porch using salvaged and in-kind materials.
4. Perform rehabilitative scopes of work including window and door repair, siding and foundation skirting repair, structural foundation repair, and the installation of a standing seam metal roof and new gutters and downspouts.
5. Convert one, side window into a door opening to provide egress.
6. Replace six (6) existing, dormer windows with ventilation grilles.
7. Enclose the rear, 2-story porch and construct a 2-story, rear addition in the location of the existing, rear porch.
8. Install a retaining wall featuring fencing and masonry planters at the property's perimeter along McCullough and Woodlawn to replace existing, non-uniform fencing elements.
9. Install a monument sign at the corner of McCullough and Woodlawn.
10. Install a new sidewalk on Woodlawn, parallel to the street and make sit improvements at the corner of McCullough and Woodlawn.
11. Perform on site paving to introduce accessible pathways and ramps throughout the campus.
12. Create an outdoor gathering deck/terrace to the south of the primary historic structure on site.

13. Perform landscaping work including the installation of various trees thro

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #1, the demolition of the existing, rear accessory structure based on findings c through e with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the structure be deconstructed by a Certified Deconstruction Contractor, as required by the Chapter 12, Article II of the City Code of Ordinances.
 - ii. That materials be salvaged and considered for reuse on site.
2. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #2, the construction of a new, rear accessory structure, based on findings f through j with the following stipulations:
 - i. That materials that relate to the period of construction of the primary structure be used. Staff does not find the use of metal façade panels to be consistent with the Guidelines.
3. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #3, the reconstruction of the historic structure's front porch, based on finding k, as submitted.
4. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #4, rehabilitative scopes of work, based on finding l, as submitted.
5. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #5, the conversion of an original window opening to a door opening, based on finding m, as submitted.
6. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #6, the replacement of six (6) dormer windows with ventilation grilles, based on finding n, with the following stipulation:
 - i. That grilles should be painting in a manner that is consistent with the material and color palette of the rehabilitated structure.
7. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #7, the enclosure of the 2-story, rear porch and the construction of a rear addition, based on findings o through q, with the following stipulations:
 - i. That if fiber cement siding is used, it feature a four (4) to five (5) inch exposure and a smooth finish.
 - ii. That windows adhere to the adopted standards for windows in new construction.
8. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #8, the installation of a retaining wall featuring fencing and masonry planters, based on finding r, with the following stipulation:
 - i. That fencing on top of the retaining wall not exceed four (4) feet in height, per the Guidelines for Site Elements.
9. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #9, the installation of a monument sign at the corner of McCullough and Woodlawn based on finding s, with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the proposed sign not exceed six (6) feet in height.
 - ii. That the proposed sign feature indirect illumination and not feature plastic elements.
10. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #10, the installation of a new sidewalk on Woodlawn, based on finding r, with the following stipulation:
 - i. That the proposed sidewalk match the existing sidewalks on Woodlawn regarding material and finish.
11. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #11, on site paving, as submitted, based on finding u.
12. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #12, the construction of an outdoor deck/terrace, based on finding v, with the following stipulation:
 - i. That complete construction documents be developed and submitted for review and approval when returning to the Commission for final approval.
13. Staff recommends conceptual approval of item #13, landscaping and tree planting, based on finding w, with the following stipulation:
 - i. That detailed landscaping documents be submitted for review and approval when returning to the Commission for final approval.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- The Monte Vista Historical Association submitted a letter in support of the request.

MOTION: Commissioner Velásquez moved to approve items 2 and 8 as presented by the applicant, and approve items 1, 3-7, and 9-13 with staff stipulations. Commissioner Holland seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Velásquez, Galloway, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Castillo and Cervantes.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

ITEM 8. HDRC NO. 2024-375
ADDRESS: 1002 KAMPMANN BLVD
APPLICANT: Adan Ochoa/AO Design, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Demolish an existing, rear accessory structure.
2. Construct a new, 2-story, rear accessory structure to feature a footprint of approximately 1,360 square feet and an overall height of approximately twenty-three (23) feet.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff recommends approval of item #1, the demolition of the existing, rear accessory structure based on findings a through e with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the structure be deconstructed by a Certified Deconstruction Contractor, as required by the Chapter 12, Article II of the City Code of Ordinances.
 - ii. That the applicant explore the reuse of salvaged materials on site.
2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2, the construction of a 2-story, rear accessory structure based on findings f through j. Staff recommends the following items be addressed prior to a recommendation for approval:
 - i. That the applicant reduce the proposed footprint to be consistent with the Guidelines, as noted in finding g. The proposed footprint should not exceed forty (40) percent of the historic structure's footprint.
 - ii. That the applicant reduce the structure's overall height as to appear as a subordinate structure on site.
 - iii. That the applicant introduce additional fenestration to each façade as well as additional façade articulation. Additionally, staff recommends the applicant revise the structure's roof form to relate to the roof form of the primary historic structure on site and to reduce the proposed structure's massing.
 - iv. That the proposed aluminum clad wood windows be consistent with the adopted policy guide for windows.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Robin Foster, on behalf of the Monticello Park Architectural Review Committee, submitted a voicemail in support of staff recommendations for approval of item 1 and conceptual approval of item 2.

- The Monticello Park Architectural Review Committee submitted a letter with the same information outlined in the voicemail.

MOTION 1: Commissioner Velásquez moved to approve revised drawings, and staff stipulations.
No Commissioner seconded the motion.

ACTION: **MOTION FAILED; No second.**

MOTION 2: Commissioner Grube moved to approve item 1 and conceptual approval of item 2.
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Galloway, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Cervantes.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 10 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 9. HDRC NO. 2024-399
ADDRESS: 734 N NEW BRAUNFELS AVE
APPLICANT: George Rodriguez

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install an approximately 4 sqft acrylic and aluminum blade sign with an internally illuminated cabinet.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval to install an approximately 4 sq. ft. blade sign with the following stipulation;

- That the proposed signage is amended to include the change in material, color, and lighting system in conformance with Guidelines as noted in findings c thru e. Updated specifications must be submitted to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness at the administrative level.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Velásquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Galloway, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Cervantes.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 10 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 10. WITHDRAWN PRIOR TO HEARING

ADJOURNMENT: Chairman Gibbs adjourned the meeting at 4:08 p.m.

APPROVED



J. Maurice Gibbs, Chair
Historic Design Review Commission
City of San Antonio

Date: 18 DEC 24