

2015 FEB 10 PM 12:00



**Agenda
Charter Review Commission**

**City Hall
Media Briefing Room
February 13, 2015**

2:00 PM

A MEETING OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN ANTONIO WILL BE HELD ON **FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 13, 2015, AT 2:00 P.M.** IN THE MEDIA BRIEFING ROOM, CITY HALL, 100 MILITARY PLAZA, SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS, 78205 FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON THE FOLLOWING MATTERS:

1. Approval of Minutes
2. Discussion on Citizen Input
3. Committee Reports
 - a. Council Compensation
 - b. Mayoral Mid-Term and Council Terms
 - c. Obsolete, Outdated and Unwieldy Provisions
4. Discussion on Commission's report to City Council
5. Adjournment

At any time during the Charter Review Commission Meeting, the commission may meet in executive session regarding any of the matters posted above in compliance with the Texas Open Meetings Act.

DISABILITY ACCESS STATEMENT

CITY HALL, 100 Military Plaza, is wheelchair accessible. Accessible entry ramp on west side of building. Accessible visitor parking on north side of building. Auxiliary aids and services, including Deaf interpreters, must be requested forty-eight [48] hours prior to the meeting. For assistance, call (210) 207-7268 or 711 Texas Relay Service for the Deaf.

**CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION
PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 7, 2015
6:00 PM
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS**

Mayor Taylor opened the Public Hearing.

1. Joint City Council of San Antonio and Charter Review Commission Public Hearing on possible Amendments to the City Charter

George Alejos spoke in opposition to Street Cars and noted that LULAC would be monitoring the topic.

Henry Rodriguez stated that citizens were against fluoride being added into the water supply and requested that citizens be able to vote on this issue.

Nikki Kuhns expressed her concern with the broad language of the City Charter and with the installation of Smart Meters. She requested that said item be placed on the May Ballot as a Charter Amendment Proposition.

Rhett Smith requested that the Charter Amendments require Councilmembers be accountable to the citizenry.

Roberto Escobedo spoke in support of increasing Council Pay. He requested data comparing council salary by City and asked if the number of Councilmembers would be increased.

Nazirite Ruben Flores Perez expressed his concern with the inclusion of fluoride in the water and the use of Smart Meters by CPS Energy.

Branden Dross highlighted a study conducted by his UTSA Class which focused on Council Pay. In conclusion, Mr. Dross expressed his support for increasing Council Pay.

Jack M. Finger requested that the Non-Discrimination Ordinance be repealed and stated that citizens should have the opportunity to vote on Council Pay.

There being no further Citizens signed up to speak, Mayor Taylor closed the Public Hearing.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 2:30 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,

Charles Cotrell, Chair

Melinda L. Uriegas, Office of the City Clerk

**CHARTER REVIEW COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
FRIDAY, JANUARY 9, 2015
2:00 PM
MEDIA BRIEFING ROOM**

Members Present: Charles Cotrell, *Chair*; Lisa Barratachea, *Community Representative*; Sharon De La Garza, *Human Resources Expert*; Councilmember Mike Gallagher, *District 10*; Juan Garcia, *Community Representative*; Frank Garza, *Municipal Law Expert*; Art Hall, *Former Elected Official*; Patricia Rodriguez, *Municipal Finance Expert*; Francine Romero, *Community Representative*; Jeff Webster, *Former Elected Official*

Members Present via conference call: David McGee, *Community Representative*

Staff Present: Sheryl Sculley, *City Manager*; Carlos Contreras, *Assistant City Manager*; Martha Sepeda, *City Attorney*; Leticia M. Vacek, *City Clerk*; Camila Kunau, *Assistant City Attorney*, Ed Guzman, *Assistant City Attorney*; Melinda L. Uriegas, *Assistant City Clerk*; John Peterek, *Special Projects Manager*; Mario Hune, *Chief of Staff, District 10*

Others Present: Paulina Rubio, *AVP, Public Affairs, San Antonio Chamber of Commerce*; Nathan Alonzo, *SAPFFA*; Rudy Morales, *SAPFFA*

City Clerk Leticia Vacek Called the Roll noting that a quorum was present.

Mrs. Vacek administered Oaths of Office to Charter Review Commission Members not present at the December 18, 2014 Meeting.

Chairman Cotrell stated that Mr. McGee would be participating via conference call.

1. Discussion of Public Comments received at the January 7, 2015 Public Hearing.

Chairman Cotrell reviewed comments made by citizens at the Public Hearing held on Wednesday, January 7, 2015. He noted that a total of eight citizens spoke and comments focused on council continuity and compensation.

Items 3 and 4 were addressed next.

3. Possible Appointment of Subcommittee Members and Chairs.

4. Discussion and possible scheduling of future Meetings.

Chairman Cotrell distributed Sub-Committee Membership information and stated that City Staff would be available to assist Commission Members in developing Charter Amendment Recommendations. He reviewed the Committee's Calendar and noted that Reports would be presented at the Charter Review Commission Meeting scheduled for Friday, January 16, 2015.

Councilmember Mike Gallagher stated that he would not accept Council Pay since he was serving as a Member of the Charter Review Commission. Discussion transpired regarding the inclusion of ballot language which would exclude current Councilmembers from receiving compensation and provisions for an effective date.

2. Discussion of Possible Charter Amendments

Martha Sepeda highlighted information submitted by City Manager Sculley. Ms. Sculley explained the data was gathered as a result of requests made by Commission Members at the December 18, 2014 Meeting.

Lisa Barratachea requested clarification of the selection of the Cities surveyed. It was reported by Ms. Sculley that all Cities had a Council-Manager Form of Government. At the request of Art Hall, Ms. Sepeda noted that the handouts included how financial data was indexed and methods for making adjustments.

Frank Garza noted that the information reported in the handouts for the City of Dallas were incorrect as said Council Compensation was increased via a November 2014 Charter Amendment Election. He noted that the approved increase would go into effect June, 2015.

Councilmember Gallagher spoke on a commentary he authored which is scheduled for publication in the Express News on January 10, 2015. He added that said article compares how Council-Manager forms of government across the county operate in comparison to San Antonio.

Dr. Romero spoke on a Project conducted by her UTSA Students which entailed conducting surveys and focus groups relating to Council Pay. She stated that the Community was not aware if compensation was paid to Councilmembers and that participants spoke in support of Council Pay.

Ms. Barratachea asked for clarification regarding the classification of Councilmembers as Full-Time or Part-Time Employees. It was reported that the respective Cities surveyed indicated by Charter or Ordinance that Councilmembers were Full-time. If classification was silent, it was inferred that Councilmembers were considered to be Part-Time. Discussion transpired to reflect that City of San Antonio Members of Council were Full-time.

David McGee spoke of a Committee established in Phoenix with the intent of reviewing Council Compensation every 4 years. Mrs. Sculley spoke on the dynamics of the Committee and noted that Phoenix Citizens had the ability to vote on Council Compensation increases based on Committee recommendations. She reported that pay increases proposed by the Committee were based on inflation or other economic factors and that language was written to exclude the sitting Members of Council from receiving the increases.

A discussion ensued on health benefits offered to Councilmembers. Mrs. Sculley reported that Councilmembers had the option to pay for Health Benefits and that those benefits were similar to those offered to Civilian Employees. Sharon De La Garza spoke on pension plans offered to State Officeholders.

Mr. Hall asked how each City surveyed indexed Council Compensation for example, using the Median Household Income or compensation paid to their County Officeholders. He spoke of previous Initiatives on Council Compensation and suggested community outreach efforts.

Jeff Webster spoke on studies previously undertaken for Charter Amendment Propositions and agreed with Mr. Hall's recommendation that a Third Party Entity conduct a survey. He highlighted efforts while he was in Office to pay Councilmembers similar to what Teachers were paid. Mr. Webster spoke on the importance of educational outreach and the need to inform the Community of the increased demands made of Councilmembers over the years.

Mr. McGee asked to be provided with data regarding Compensation paid to Bexar County Commissioners.

At the request of Dr. Romero, Mrs. Sculley reported that the City would create informational documents related to the Charter Amendment Propositions.

Ms. De La Garza asked of benefits paid to State Officeholders, specifically information on Pensions. She spoke of the possibility of City Councilmembers resigning to run for State Office due to the compensation, benefits, and pension paid.

Martha Sepeda reported that the City had created a Charter Review website which detailed Meeting Agendas and previous Reports. She noted that said website had received many hits.

Mr. Webster asked to be provided with data detailing the number of council seats with incumbents Applying for a Place on the Ballot compared to non-incumbents. He spoke of the impact increasing Council Compensation and Benefits would have on individuals Applying for a Place on the Ballot.

Councilmember Gallagher suggested that additional Council Compensation be funded via the line item used to pay Council Aides. He noted that said would allow for Council to be paid without negatively impacting each Budget.

Discussion transpired regarding the City of San Antonio Council compensation as the lowest in the Country. It was stated that there was a need to increase voter awareness.

David McGee was obligated to leave the Meeting at this time.

Frank Garza stated that he would not be able to attend the Meeting scheduled for January 16, 2015. He noted that City Staff would be presenting his recommended changes on his behalf.

Ms. Sepeda provided an overview on the current Mayoral Vacancy process and noted that said topic was a priority for the City Council to be amended. She reported that the deadline to approve Charter Amendment Ballot Language is Friday, February 27, 2015 and that City Council was scheduled to Meet on Thursday, February 26, 2015.

Discussion ensued regarding the inclusion of extending Council terms of office and implementation of staggered terms of office on the May 2015 Ballot. Chairman Cotrell reiterated that the priority of the Commission was to address items outlined by the Council.

At the recommendation of Councilmember Gallagher, Mrs. Vacek detailed proposed changes to Sections 27 and 38 of the City Charter regarding the number of days given for verifying Petitions. She spoke on the benefits of changing the verbiage to 30 Business Days and recommended that an Amendment be included in the recommendations addressing Outdated Charter Provisions.

Councilmember Gallagher spoke on the Ethics Compliance Auditor being independent and recommended that said position be removed from the Auditor's Office on a future Charter Amendment Ballot.

Ms. Barratachea requested that Media Outreach efforts be increased in order to increase citizen participation and offered suggestions on how to achieve this goal. After discussion, Commission Members agreed on the need to conduct another Public Hearing. Ms. Sculley highlighted Media Outreach efforts to be undertaken by the City from this point forward.

5. Adjournment

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 3:26 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,

Charles Cotrell, Chair

Melinda L. Uriegas, Office of the City Clerk

City Council Compensation Comparison

CITY	ELECTED OFFICIAL SALARY	COUNCIL SIZE	SINGLE MEMBER OR AT LARGE DISTRICTS	CITY POPULATION	AVERAGE NUMBER OF RESIDENTS REPRESENTED BY COUNCIL DISTRICT
Fort Worth, TX	Mayor - \$29,000 Council - \$25,000	9	Single Member council with mayor at large	792,727	99,090
Austin, TX	Mayor - \$81,344 Council - \$69,885	11	Single Member council with mayor at large	885,400	88,540
San Jose, CA	Mayor - \$114,000 Council - \$89,000	11	Single Member council with mayor at large	998,537	99,854
Phoenix, AZ	Mayor - \$88,000 Council - \$61,610	9	Single Member council with mayor at large	1.513 M	189,125
El Paso, TX	Mayor - \$42,000 Council - \$30,450	9	Single Member council with mayor at large	674,433	84,304
Dallas, TX	Mayor - \$60,000 Council - \$37,500 Starting in June Mayor - \$80,000 Council - \$60,000	15	Single Member council with mayor at large	1.258 M	89,857
San Antonio, TX	Mayor - \$4,040 Council - \$1,040	11	Single Member council with mayor at large	1.409 M	140,900

Each City listed operates under a council-manager form of government
 Source: www.pewtrusts.org; various city charters
 Prepared by Office of the City Manager, February 12, 2014

City Council Compensation Comparison

Each City listed operates under a council-manager form of government
Source: www.pewtrusts.org; various city charters
Prepared by Office of the City Manager, February 12, 2014

John Peterek (CMO)

From: John Peterek (CMO)
Sent: Friday, February 13, 2015 1:46 PM
To: 'Liza'
Subject: RE: Non Uniform Employees COLA History

City	Mayor	Council
Fort Worth, TX	\$29,000	\$25,000
Austin, TX	\$81,344	\$69,885
San Jose, CA	\$114,000	\$89,000
Phoenix, AZ	\$88,000	\$61,610
El Paso, TX	\$42,000	\$30,450
Dallas, TX	\$80,000	\$60,000
Average	\$72,390.67	\$55,990.83

From: Liza [<mailto:lbarratachea@gmail.com>]
Sent: Friday, February 13, 2015 12:14 PM
To: John Peterek (CMO)
Subject: RE: Non Uniform Employees COLA History

John,
Did we come up with the mid-range salary – the average salary from like-size cities per capita?
LB

From: John Peterek (CMO) [<mailto:John.Peterek@sanantonio.gov>]
Sent: Thursday, February 12, 2015 2:10 PM
To: patricia rodriguez; David McGee (TX); Sharon Martin; Liza; Jeff Webster; Camila Kunau (City Attorney); Edward Guzman (City Attorney)
Subject: Non Uniform Employees COLA History

Good Afternoon,

I have attached the 20 year history of non-uniform cost of living increases. Please note that in the 1999-1997 period includes what was listed as a COLA but does not match the traditional definition. That period helped to move lower wage earners more quickly through the pay range.

If you have any questions, let me know.

With Regards,

John Peterek, MPAff
Special Projects Manager
Office of the City Manager